

DEBATING
the
DIVINE

RELIGION IN
21st CENTURY
AMERICAN
DEMOCRACY

Edited by Sally Steenland

Center for American Progress



THE FAITH AND PROGRESSIVE POLICY INITIATIVE

A project of the Center for American Progress, the Faith and Progressive Policy Initiative works to identify and articulate the moral, ethical, and spiritual values underpinning policy issues, to shape a progressive stance in which these values are clear, and to increase public awareness and understanding of these values. The Initiative also works to safeguard the healthy separation of church and state that has allowed religion in our country to flourish. In all its efforts, the Initiative works for a society and government that strengthen the common good and respect the basic dignity of all people.

THE CENTER FOR THE AMERICAN PROGRESS

The Center for the American Progress is a nonpartisan research and educational institute dedicated to promoting a strong, just and free America that ensures opportunity for all. We believe that Americans are bound together by a common commitment to these values and we aspire to ensure that our national policies reflect these values. We work to find progressive and pragmatic solutions to significant domestic and international problems and develop policy proposals that foster a government that is “of the people, by the people, and for the people.”

Center for American Progress
1333 H Street NW, 10th Floor
Washington, D.C. 20005
Tel: 202.682.1611 • Fax: 202.682.1867
www.americanprogress.org

Copyright © 2008 Center for American Progress

ISBN 978-0-615-21863-2

June 2008

DEBATING
the
DIVINE



RELIGION IN
21st CENTURY
AMERICAN
DEMOCRACY

Edited by Sally Steenland

Center for American Progress



Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION

| | |
|---------------------------|---|
| Debating the Divine | 4 |
| Sally Steenland | |

OPENING ESSAYS

| | |
|---|---|
| Civic Patriotism and the Critical Discussion of Religious Ideas | 8 |
| David A. Hollinger | |

| | |
|--|----|
| Religious Pluralism in the Public Square | 16 |
| Eboo Patel | |

RESPONDING ESSAYS

| | |
|-------------------------|----|
| The Two Cultures? | 28 |
| Mark Lilla | |

| | |
|-------------------------------------|----|
| Religion in the Public Square | 32 |
| Nicholas Wolterstorff | |

| | |
|--|----|
| Religions and Public Life: Problems of Translation | 36 |
| Martha Minow | |

| | |
|---|----|
| Wisdom, Not Prescription: One Size Does Not Fit All | 40 |
| Mark A. Noll | |

| | |
|---|----|
| Nobody Gets a Pass: Faith in Reason and Religious Pluralism Are Equally Questionable | 44 |
| Susan Brooks Thistlethwaite | |

Clothes Encounters in the Naked Public Square 48
T. Jeremy Gunn

America’s Tower of Religious Babble Is Already Too High 52
Susan Jacoby

Religion and Community Organizing: Prophetic Religion and
Social Justice Offer Avenues to a New Democratic Pluralism. 56
Charlene K. Sinclair

The Rules of Engagement: How the American Tradition of
Religious Freedom Helps Define Religion’s Role in Civic Debate 60
Melissa Rogers

Globalization, the End of Easy Consensus, and Beginning
the Real Work of Pluralism 64
Vincent J. Miller

Liberals and Religion 70
Alan Wolfe

CLOSING ESSAYS

Patterns of Engagement and Evasion77
David A. Hollinger

The Promise of Religious Pluralism81
Eboo Patel

POLICYMAKER RESPONSE

Transforming the Religious–Secular Divide to Work for the Common Good 86
John D. Podesta and Shaun Casey

ABOUT THE AUTHORS 88

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS 95

About the Authors

SHAUN CASEY

Shaun Casey is a Visiting Fellow at the Center for American Progress. He is also Associate Professor of Christian Ethics at Wesley Theological Seminary in Washington, D.C., where he directs the National Capital Semester for Seminarians, a Washington-based semester program in theology and public policy that is open to all seminary or divinity school students in North America.

His areas of research interest include religion and politics, religion and the presidency, the ethics of war and peace, ethics and international affairs, and theodicy as it relates to Red Sox Nation. His book, *The Making of a Catholic President: Kennedy vs. Nixon*, will be published by Oxford University Press in January 2009.

He is a frequent guest on Public Broadcasting System's "Religion and Ethics Newsweekly" television show, as well as National Public Radio. He serves on the Committee for the Public Understanding of Religion of the American Academy of Religion.

Casey received a Bachelor of Arts degree from Abilene Christian University, a Master of Divinity degree from Harvard Divinity School, a Master in Public Administration degree from the Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University, and a Doctor of Theology degree in Religion and Society from Harvard Divinity School.

T. JEREMY GUNN

Dr. T. Jeremy Gunn is the Director of the American Civil Liberties Union's Program on Freedom of Religion and Belief and the Senior Fellow for Religion and Human Rights at the Center for the Study of Law and Religion at Emory University School of Law. He is a member of the Advisory Council on Freedom of Religion and Belief of the Office of Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (ODIHR) of the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE). He received his Ph.D. in the Study of Religion from Harvard University, a J.D., *magna cum laude*, from Boston University, and an A.M. in Humanities from the University of Chicago. He was an attorney at the law firm Covington & Burling, after which he held several positions in the U.S. government, including the U.S. Department of State (Office of International Religious Freedom). Among his publications are *Spiritual Weapons: The Cold War and the Forging of an American National Religion* (2008, forthcoming), "Religious Liberty (Modern Period)" in the *Encyclopedia of Christianity*

(2005), and “Religious Symbols and Religious Liberty in American Public Life” in the *Oxford Handbook on Church and State in the United States* (ed. Derek Davis).

DAVID A. HOLLINGER

David A. Hollinger has written extensively about the relations between ethnicity, religion, ideology, and politics in the history of the United States. His recent books include *Cosmopolitanism and Solidarity* (2006), *Postethnic America: Beyond Multiculturalism* (3rd edition, expanded, 2006), and an edited volume, *The Humanities and the Dynamics of Inclusion* (2006). His earlier books include *Science, Jews, and Secular Culture* (1996). His recent essays have appeared in *Daedalus*, *London Review of Books*, *Representations*, *Modern Intellectual History*, *Journal of American Ethnic History*, and *Chronicle of Higher Education*. He is Vice President of the Organization of American Historians, a Trustee of the Institute for Advanced Study, and an elected Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences. He was formerly Harmsworth Professor of American History at the University of Oxford and is now Preston Hotchkis Professor of American History at the University of California, Berkeley, where he recently served as Chair of his department. He is currently studying the impact of the Protestant foreign missionary project on the history of the United States in the 20th century.

SUSAN JACOBY

Susan Jacoby's most recent book is *The Age of American Unreason*, published in February 2008. Her seven other books include *Freethinkers: A History of American Secularism*, selected as a notable book of 2004 by *The Washington Post* and *The Los Angeles Times*; *Half-Jew: A Daughter's Search for her Family's Buried Past* (2000); and *Wild Justice: The Evolution of Revenge* (1984), a Pulitzer Prize finalist.

Jacoby has been a frequent contributor to national magazines and newspapers, including *The New York Times*, *The Washington Post*, *The Los Angeles Times*, *Mother Jones*, *The American Prospect*, *The AARP Magazine*, and *Harper's*. She has been the recipient of numerous fellowships and awards, including a Guggenheim Fellowship and a grant from the National Endowment for the Humanities. In 2001–2002, she was selected as a fellow of the Cullman Center for Scholars and Writers of the New York Public Library. In 2007, she received an award from the Americans for Libraries Council for her writing on behalf of public libraries.

Susan Jacoby also serves as a program consultant to the Center for Inquiry-New York City, a rationalist think tank. She lives in New York.

MARK LILLA

Mark Lilla is Professor of the Humanities at Columbia University and author, most recently, of *The Stillborn God: Religion, Politics, and the Modern West* (2007).

VINCENT J. MILLER

Vincent J. Miller is an Associate Professor of Theology at Georgetown University where he teaches in the doctoral program in Religious Pluralism. He received his doctorate in Systematic Theology from the University of Notre Dame. He has published numerous articles on culture and religious traditions, beliefs, and practices and has lectured widely in the United States, Mexico, Europe, and

Asia. His book, *Consuming Religion: Christian Faith and Practice in a Consumer Culture* (2004), considers how religious communities are being transformed from within by consumer attitudes and practices, and how they can work to counter this. His current research explores the impact of globalization and the “culture of choice” upon the fragmentation of religious communities and the polarization of religious and political discourse.

MARTHA MINOW

Martha Minow is the Jeremiah Smith, Jr. Professor of Law at Harvard Law School, where she teaches constitutional law, civil procedure, human rights, and education law and writes about human rights and advocacy for members of racial and religious minorities and for women, children, and persons with disabilities. Her books include *Breaking the Cycles of Hatred: Memory, Law and Repair* (2003); *Partners, Not Rivals: Privatization and the Public Good* (2002); *Between Vengeance and Forgiveness: Facing History After Genocide and Mass Violence* (1998); *Not Only for Myself: Identity, Politics and Law* (1997); and *Making All the Difference: Inclusion, Exclusion, and American Law* (1990). She is the co-editor of *Just Schools: Pursuing Equality in Societies of Difference* (2008) and *Engaging Cultural Differences: The Multicultural Challenge in Liberal Democracies* (2002). She served on the Independent International Commission on Kosovo and helped to launch Imagine Co-existence, a program of the U.N. High Commissioner for Refugees, to promote peaceful development in post-conflict societies. She has served on the boards of the Jewish Women’s Archive, the Covenant Foundation, and Harvard-Radcliffe Hillel. Prior to teaching, she was a law clerk to Justice Thurgood Marshall. Minow received an Honorary Doctor of Law from the University of Toronto Faculty of Law in 2006 and the Sacks-Freund Award for Excellence in Teaching from Harvard Law School in 2005.

MARK A. NOLL

Mark A. Noll, Francis A. McAnaney Professor of History at the University of Notre Dame, is the author of *The Civil War as a Theological Crisis* (2006) and *God and Race in American Politics: A Short History* (2008), as well as co-editor of *Religion and American Politics: From the Colonial Period to the Present* (2nd ed., 2007).

EBOO PATEL

Eboo Patel is the Founder and Executive Director of the Interfaith Youth Core, a Chicago-based international nonprofit building the interfaith youth movement. He is the author of *Acts of Faith: The Story of an American Muslim, the Struggle for the Soul of a Generation*. He writes a featured blog called “The Faith Divide” for *The Washington Post*, and is a regular guest on National Public Radio and CNN. He is also a sought-after public speaker, delivering the keynote address at the 2004 Nobel Peace Prize Forum, speaking at the Clinton Global Initiative, and giving the Baccalaureate Service Address at both the University of Pennsylvania and Dartmouth College. Patel has a doctorate in the sociology of religion from Oxford University, where he studied on a Rhodes scholarship. He is an Ashoka Fellow and was named one of ten young Muslim visionaries shaping Islam in America by *Islamica Magazine*.

JOHN D. PODESTA

John D. Podesta is the president and CEO of the Center for American Progress and Visiting Professor of Law at the Georgetown University Law Center. Podesta served as chief of staff to President William J. Clinton from October 1998 until January 2001, where he was responsible for directing, managing, and overseeing all policy development, daily operations, Congressional relations, and staff activities of the White House. He coordinated the work of cabinet agencies with a particular emphasis on the development of federal budget and tax policy, and served in the President's Cabinet and as a principal on the National Security Council. From 1997 to 1998 he served as both an Assistant to the President and deputy chief of staff. Earlier, from January 1993 to 1995, he was Assistant to the President, Staff Secretary and a senior policy adviser on government information, privacy, telecommunications security and regulatory policy. Podesta previously held a number of positions on Capitol Hill including: counselor to Democratic Leader Senator Thomas A. Daschle; chief counsel for the Senate Agriculture Committee; chief minority counsel for the Senate Judiciary Subcommittees on Patents, Copyrights, and Trademarks; Security and Terrorism; and Regulatory Reform; and counsel on the Majority Staff of the Senate Judiciary Committee. Podesta is a graduate of Georgetown University Law Center and Knox College.

MELISSA ROGERS

Melissa Rogers serves as Visiting Professor of Religion and Public Policy at Wake Forest University Divinity School. She is the founder and director of Wake Forest's Center for Religion and Public Affairs, which promotes research, study, and dialogue regarding the intersection of religion and public affairs and provides resources for students and religious leaders on these issues.

Rogers previously served as the executive director of the Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life and as general counsel of the Baptist Joint Committee on Religious Liberty. While at the Baptist Joint Committee, she helped lead a diverse coalition that was instrumental in bringing about the enactment of the Religious Land Use and Institutionalized Persons Act of 2000. She also served as a draftsperson for several *amicus curiae* briefs in church-state cases heard by the U.S. Supreme Court.

In 2004, Rogers was recognized by National Journal as one of the church-state experts "politicians will call on when they get serious about addressing an important public policy issue." She is co-authoring a case book on religion and law for Baylor University Press and recently testified before the Judiciary Committee to the U.S. Senate.

Rogers earned her law degree from the University of Pennsylvania Law School, where she was a member of the National Moot Court Team and a legal writing instructor. She graduated Phi Beta Kappa from Baylor University.

CHARLENE K. SINCLAIR

Charlene K. Sinclair is the Principal of InSinc Consulting, a consulting firm that provides comprehensive grassroots organizing, political strategy, and targeted organizational development assistance. Sinclair is also a fellow at the Center for Community Change's Taproots Project, where she develops projects to engage low-income leaders, grassroots organizers, and public intellectuals to discuss the intersection of spirituality and roots of struggles for social and economic justice.

Sinclair served as the Director of National Campaigns for the Center for Community Change, one of the nation's leading organizational voices for traditionally disenfranchised communities, where she led the campaign to mobilize low-income voters for the 2004 presidential election. She also served as the Director of Organizing for the National Campaign for Jobs and Income Support, where she worked to restore economic safety and dignity to low-income people. She served as the Deputy Director of Housing for the Commonwealth of Virginia, where she worked to develop and implement Commonwealth housing policies, housing development, lead abatement, and homeless programs.

Sinclair received a B.S. in Sociology from Trinity College in Hartford, CT, a Masters of Divinity from Union Theological Seminary in New York, and will begin doctoral studies in the fall of 2008. She is a longtime community organizer and brings a strong sense of spiritual and intellectual inquiry to her work.

SALLY STEENLAND

Sally Steenland is Senior Advisor to the Faith and Progressive Policy Initiative at the Center for American Progress. In 2005, she organized the Initiative's "national conversations," a series of town-hall meetings and discussions across the country on pressing issues of faith and policy. She guides the Initiative's work on a variety of policy issues, including faith and science, the role of religion in the public square, diversity and tolerance, economics, the environment, and cultural and social matters. She is also co-editor of *Pursuing the Global Common Good: Principle and Practice in U.S. Foreign Policy*.

In the 1990s, she was a frequent op-ed columnist for *The Philadelphia Inquirer*. In the 1980s, she was Deputy Director of the National Commission on Working Women, where she wrote major studies on women's employment and women in the media and directed projects involving women in nonprofessional jobs. For several years she taught English, filmmaking and critical media studies in high schools.

Steenland has written two best-selling books, *The Magnetic Poetry Book* and the award-winning *Kids' Magnetic Book of Poetry*. Her short stories have appeared in many literary journals and anthologies, and her story collection, *Skin and Bones*, was a finalist in the 2004 Bakeless Literary Prize for fiction. Steenland was raised in a Dutch Calvinist community in northern New Jersey. She received a B.A. in English from Calvin College in Grand Rapids, Michigan, and a Masters in Education from Howard University.

SUSAN BROOKS THISTLETHWAITE

The Reverend Susan Brooks Thistlethwaite, Ph.D., was the 11th President of Chicago Theological Seminary, serving from 1998 until 2008. She has been a Professor of Theology at CTS for 24 years, director of the Ph.D. Center for five years, has a Ph.D. from Duke University, a Masters of Divinity, *summa cum laude*, from Duke Divinity School, and a B.A. from Smith College.

An ordained minister of the United Church of Christ since 1974, she is the author or editor of 13 books and has been a translator for two different translations of the Bible. Thistlethwaite works in the area of contextual theologies of liberation, specializing in issues of violence and violation. Her works include *Casting Stones: Prostitution and Liberation in Asia and the United States* (1996),

The New Testament and Psalms: An Inclusive Translation (1995), and *Adam, Eve and the Genome: Theology in Dialogue with the Human Genome Project* (2003).

Thistlethwaite has had two appearances on *ABC News NIGHTLINE*, has written more than a dozen editorials appearing in major newspapers, and has been interviewed and quoted on various radio shows in the United States and in the Middle East. She is a weekly contributor to the *WashingtonPost/Newsweek* online “On Faith” blog and is a Senior Fellow at the Center for American Progress.

ALAN WOLFE

Alan Wolfe is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Boisi Center for Religion and American Public Life at Boston College. His recent books include *Does American Democracy Still Work?* (2006) and *Return to Greatness: How America Lost Its Sense of Purpose and What it Needs to Do to Recover It* (2005). He is the author or editor of more than 11 other books, two of which were selected as *New York Times* Notable Books of the Year.

Wolfe attended Temple University as an undergraduate and received his doctorate in political science from the University of Pennsylvania. He currently chairs a task force of the American Political Science Association on “Religion and Democracy in the United States” and is writing a book on the future of liberalism. He is a Senior Fellow with the World Policy Institute at the New School University in New York. He is a contributing editor and writer for *The New Republic*, *The Wilson Quarterly*, *Commonwealth Magazine*, and *In Character*, and also writes for *Commonweal*, *The New York Times*, *Harper’s*, *The Atlantic Monthly*, and *The Washington Post*.

Wolfe was an advisor to President Clinton in preparation for his 1995 State of the Union address and has lectured widely at American and European universities.

NICHOLAS WOLTERSTORFF

Nicholas Wolterstorff is the Noah Porter Professor Emeritus of Philosophical Theology at Yale University and Senior Fellow of the Institute for Advanced Studies in Culture at the University of Virginia.

He received his B.A. from Calvin College in 1953 and his Ph.D. in philosophy from Harvard University in 1956. He taught philosophy for two years at Yale and for 30 years at Calvin College before returning to Yale in 1989 as the Noah Porter Professor in Philosophical Theology.

After concentrating on metaphysics at the beginning of his career (*On Universals*), he spent years working on aesthetics and the philosophy of art (*Works and Worlds of Art* and *Art in Action*). In more recent years, he has concentrated on epistemology (*John Locke and the Ethics of Belief* and *Thomas Reid and the Story of Epistemology*), on philosophy of religion (*Divine Discourse* and *Faith and Rationality*), and political philosophy (*Until Justice and Peace Embrace* and *Religion in the Public Square*). His latest book is *Justice: Rights and Wrongs*.

In the fall of 1993, Wolterstorff gave the Wilde Lectures at Oxford University (published as *Divine Discourse*), and in the spring of 1995 he gave the Gifford Lectures at St. Andrews University. He has been president of the American Philosophical Association (Central Division) and of the Society of Christian Philosophers. He is a fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

“For too long religion has been played as political football, scoring points as we cheer our side and demonize opponents. Onto this field comes *Debating the Divine* which challenges our assumptions and gives us a way for religion to enrich our politics. Justice becomes our goal as we are asked to care for the least among us and work for the common good.”

Kathleen Kennedy Townsend, author of *Failing America's Faithful: How Today's Churches Are Mixing God with Politics and Losing Their Way*

“These essays offer a welcome, and much needed, discussion on how religion should engage the public square. The connection between policy and values is a dynamic one, and many voices—both religious and secular—need to be heard in order to make this a more perfect union. Elected officials need to hear this conversation.”

Jesse Jackson, Jr., Congressman, Second Congressional District of Illinois

“By enabling a lively, readable, and unflinching debate about religion in public policy, *Debating the Divine* reinforces the moderating power of American pluralism and offers hope for a political process in which the sacred and the secular, while sometimes in conflict, are not in opposition.”

Bill Ivey, past chairman, National Endowment for the Arts and author of *Arts, Inc.: How Greed and Neglect Have Destroyed Our Cultural Rights*

